

Not for Publication
For Members only

LOK SABHA

SYNOPSIS OF DEBATES

(Proceedings other than Questions & Answers)

Monday, July 19, 2021 / Ashadha 28, 1943 (Saka)

NATIONAL ANTHEM

The National Anthem was played.

OATH OR AFFIRMATION

The following Members took the oath, signed the Roll of Members and took their seats in the House:-

Sl. No.	Name of Member	Constituency	State	Oath/Affirmation	Language
1	Shri Maddila Gurumoorthy	Tirupati	Andhra Pradesh	Oath	Telugu
2	Shrimati Mangal Suresh Angadi	Belgaum	Karnataka	Oath	Kannada
3	Shri M.P. Abdussamad Samadani	Malappuram	Kerala	Oath	English
4	Shri Vijayakumar <i>alias</i> Vijay Vasanth	Kanyakumari	Tamil Nadu	Oath	Tamil

INTRODUCTION OF MINISTERS

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI NARENDRA MODI) introduced the Members of the Union Council of Ministers to the House.

OBITUARY REFERENCES

HON'BLE SPEAKER: Hon'ble Members, with profound grief, I have to inform the House about the passing away of forty of our former colleagues.

Shri Skariah Thomas was a member of the 6th and 7th Lok Sabha representing the Kottayam Parliamentary Constituency of Kerala.

Shri Skariah Thomas passed away on 18 March 2021 in Kochi at the age of 74 years.

Shri Harish Narayan Prabhu Zantye was a member of the 10th Lok Sabha representing the Panaji Parliamentary Constituency of Goa.

Shri Zantye had earlier been a member of the Goa, Daman & Diu Legislative Assembly for two terms and also a member of Goa Legislative Assembly and served as Minister in the Government of Goa, Daman & Diu and Government of Goa.

Shri Harish Narayan Prabhu Zantye passed away on 20 March 2021 in Panaji at the age of 85 years.

Shri Mukhtar Anees was a member of the 11th Lok Sabha representing the Sitapur Parliamentary Constituency of Uttar Pradesh.

Shri Mukhtar Anees was a member of the Uttar Pradesh Legislative Assembly for four terms and also served as Deputy Minister in the Government of Uttar Pradesh.

Shri Mukhtar Anees passed away on 30 March 2021 in Lucknow at the age of 77 years.

Shri Shyama Charan Gupta was a member of the 14th and 16th Lok Sabha representing the Banda and Allahabad Parliamentary Constituencies of Uttar Pradesh respectively.

Shri Shyama Charan Gupta had served as member of Parliamentary Committees on Finance, Subordinate Legislation and Information Technology.

Shri Shyama Charan Gupta passed away on 09 April, 2021 in New Delhi at the age of 76 years.

Shri Digvijay Sinh was a member of the 7th and 8th Lok Sabha representing the Surendranagar Parliamentary Constituency of Gujarat.

Shri Digvijay Sinh served as Deputy Minister in the Department of Ecology and Environment.

He had earlier been a Member of Gujarat Legislative Assembly for two terms.

Shri Digvijay Sinh passed away on 03 April 2021 in Wankaner at the age of 88 years.

Shri Ajmeera Chandulal was a member of the 11th and 12th Lok Sabha representing the Warangal Parliamentary Constituency of Telangana.

Shri Chandulal was a member of the Committee on Human Resource Development, Committee on Labour and Welfare and Committee on MPLADS.

Shri Ajmeera Chandulal had earlier been a member of Andhra Pradesh Legislative Assembly for two terms. He had served as Minister in the Government of Andhra Pradesh.

Shri Ajmeera Chandulal passed away on 15 April 2021 in Hyderabad at the age of 66 years.

Shri Bachi Singh Rawat was a member of the 11th, 12th, 13th and 14th Lok Sabha representing the Almora Parliamentary Constituency of Uttarakhand.

Shri Rawat was a Minister of State in the Ministries of Defence; and Ministry of Science and Technology. He was also a member of various Parliamentary Committees.

Shri Rawat had earlier served as Member of the Uttar Pradesh Legislative Assembly for two terms and was the Deputy Minister for Revenue in the Government of Uttar Pradesh.

Shri Bachi Singh Rawat passed away on 18 April 2021 in Rishikesh at the age of 71 years.

Shri Jagdish Singh Rana was a member of 15th Lok Sabha representing the Saharanpur Parliamentary Constituency of Uttar Pradesh.

Shri Rana was a member of the Committee on Estimates and Committee on Commerce.

Earlier, Shri Jagdish Singh Rana was a member of Uttar Pradesh Legislative Assembly for five terms and also served as Minister in the Government of Uttar Pradesh.

Shri Jagdish Singh Rana passed away on 19 April 2021 in Saharanpur at the age of 66 years.

Shri Shyam Bihari Mishra was a member of the 10th, 11th, 12th and 13th Lok Sabha from Bilhaur Parliamentary Constituency of Uttar Pradesh.

An able parliamentarian, Shri Mishra was the Chairperson of the Committee on Food, Civil Supplies and Public Distribution and Joint Committee on the Essential Commodities (Amendment) Bill, 1998 and member of various Parliamentary Committees.

Shri Shyam Bihari Mishra passed away on 20 April 2021 in Kanpur at the age of 82 years.

Shri Suresh Pasi was a member of the 13th Lok Sabha representing the Chail Parliamentary Constituency of Uttar Pradesh.

Shri Pasi was member of various Committees.

Earlier, Shri Pasi served as member of the Uttar Pradesh Legislative Assembly.

Shri Suresh Pasi passed away on 22 April 2021 in Allahabad at the age of 64 years.

Prof. Dukha Bhagat was a member of the 13th Lok Sabha representing the Lohardaga Parliamentary Constituency of Jharkhand.

Shri Bhagat was member of the **Committee on Communications**.

Shri Dukha Bhagat passed away on 23 April 2021 in Ranchi at the age of 67 years.

Shri Sugrib Singh was a member of the 14th Lok Sabha representing the Phulbani Parliamentary Constituency of Odisha.

Shri Sugrib Singh was member of various Committees.

Shri Sugrib Singh passed away on 26 April, 2021 in Bhubaneswar at the age of 57 years.

Shri Rameshwar Patidar was a member of the 6th, 9th, 10th, 11th and 12th Lok Sabha representing the Khargone Parliamentary Constituency of Madhya Pradesh.

Shri Patidar was a member of the Committees on Petroleum and Chemicals, Commerce, Subordinate Legislation and Estimates.

Shri Rameshwar Patidar passed away on 27 April 2021 in Dhar, Madhya Pradesh at the age of 82 years.

Shri M. Satyanarayana Rao was a member of the 5th, 6th and 7th Lok Sabha representing the Karimnagar Parliamentary Constituency of Telangana.

Shri Rao was member of the House Committee.

Shri M. Satyanarayana Rao passed away on 27 April 2021 in Hyderabad at the age of 87 years.

Shrimati Karuna Shukla was a member of the 14th Lok Sabha representing the Janjgir Parliamentary Constituency of Chhattisgarh.

Shrimati Shukla was member of Committee on Coal and Steel and Committee on Empowerment of Women.

Shrimati Karuna Shukla passed away on 27 April 2021 in Raipur at the age of 70 years.

Shri S. B. Sidnal was a member of the 7th, 8th, 9th and 10th Lok Sabha representing the Belgaum Parliamentary Constituency of Karnataka.

Shri Sidnal was a member of the Railway Convention Committee.

Shri S. B. Sidnal passed away on 27 April 2021 in Belgavi, Karnataka at the age of 85 years.

Shri Eknath M. Gaikwad was a member of the 14th and 15th Lok Sabha representing the Mumbai-South Central Parliamentary Constituency of Maharashtra.

Shri Gaikwad had served as member of various Committees.

Shri Gaikwad had earlier been a member of Maharashtra Legislative Assembly for three terms. He had also served as Minister in Government of Maharashtra.

Shri Eknath M. Gaikwad passed away on 28 April 2021 in Mumbai at the age of 81 years.

Shri Kamla Prasad Rawat was a member of the 8th and 14th Lok Sabha representing the Barabanki Parliamentary Constituency of Uttar Pradesh.

Shri Rawat was a member of the Committees on Water Resources and Labour.

Earlier, Shri Rawat also served as a member of the Uttar Pradesh Legislative Assembly and Minister in the Government of Uttar Pradesh.

Shri Rawat passed away on 29 April 2021 in Barabanki at the age of 66 years.

Shri Laxman Giluwa was a member of the 13th and 16th Lok Sabha representing the Singhbhum Parliamentary Constituency of Jharkhand.

Shri Giluwa was member of various Committees.

Shri Laxman Giluwa had also been a member of the Bihar and Jharkhand Legislative Assemblies.

Shri Laxman Giluwa passed away on 29 April 2021 in Jamshedpur at the age of 56 years.

Dr. Mohammed Shahabuddin was a member of the 11th, 12th, 13th and 14th Lok Sabha representing the Siwan Parliamentary Constituency of Bihar.

Dr. Shahabuddin was member of various Committees.

Earlier, Dr. Shahabuddin had also been a member of the Bihar Legislative Assembly.

Dr. Mohd. Shahabuddin passed away on 1 May 2021 in New Delhi at the age of 53 years.

Shri Ram Charitra Nishad was a member of the 16th Lok Sabha representing the Machhlishahr Parliamentary Constituency of Uttar Pradesh.

Shri Nishad served as member of the Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture and Committee on the welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes.

Shri Ram Charitra Nishad passed away on 3 May 2021 in Noida at the age of 57 years.

Shri Jorawar Ram was a member of the 9th Lok Sabha representing the Palamu Parliamentary Constituency of Jharkhand.

Shri Jorawar Ram served as a member of the Bihar Legislative Assembly and also served as Minister of State in the Government of Bihar.

Shri Jorawar Ram passed away on 03 May 2021 in Palamu at the age of 78 years.

Shri Sabbam Hari was a member of the 15th Lok Sabha representing the Anakapalli Parliamentary Constituency of Andhra Pradesh.

Shri Sabbam Hari was a member of the Committee on Industry.

Shri Sabbam Hari passed away on 3 May 2021 in Visakhapatnam at the age of 68 years.

Shri Jai Narayan Roat was a member of the 7th Lok Sabha representing the erstwhile Salumber Parliamentary Constituency of Rajasthan.

Shri Jai Narayan Roat also served as a member of the Rajasthan Legislative Assembly.

Shri Jai Narayan Roat passed away on 5 May, 2021 in Udaipur at the age of 82 years.

Shri Jagmohan was a member of the 11th, 12th and 13th Lok Sabhas representing the New Delhi Parliamentary Constituency of NCT of Delhi. Shri Jagmohan had also been a member of Rajya Sabha during 1990-1996.

Shri Jagmohan had served as Lt. Governor of Delhi, Goa, Daman & Diu and as Governor of Jammu & Kashmir.

Shri Jagmohan was Cabinet Minister in the Ministries of Communications, Urban Development and Poverty Alleviation, Programme Implementation and Statistics, Tourism and Culture and also served as Chairperson of the Committee on Energy.

In the honour of his services to this nation, Shri Jagmohan had been conferred with Padma Shri in 1971, Padma Bhushan in 1977 and Padma Vibhushan in 2016.

Shri Jagmohan passed away on 4 May 2021 in New Delhi at the age of 93 years.

Shri Ajit Singh was a member of the 9th, 10th, 11th, 13th, 14th and 15th Lok Sabha representing the Baghpat Parliamentary Constituency of Uttar Pradesh.

Shri Ajit Singh served as Union Cabinet Minister in the Ministries of Industry, Food, Agriculture and Civil Aviation.

Shri Ajit Singh was a member of Parliamentary Committees on Finance, Government Assurances, Chemicals and Fertilizers and MPLADS.

Shri Ajit Singh passed away on 6 May 2021 in Gurugram at the age of 82 years.

Shri R. L. Bhatia was a member of the 5th, 7th, 8th, 10th, 11th and 13th Lok Sabha representing the Amritsar Parliamentary Constituency of Punjab.

Shri R L Bhatia served as Union Minister of State in the Ministry of External Affairs from 1992 to 1996.

Shri Bhatia was the Chairperson of the Committee on Petitions and erstwhile Committee on Food and Civil Supplies.

Shri R. L. Bhatia passed away on 06.05.2021 in Amritsar at the age of 99 years.

Prof. Rasa Singh Rawat was a member of the 9th, 10th, 11th, 13th and 14th Lok Sabha representing the Ajmer Parliamentary Constituency of Rajasthan.

Prof. Rawat was a member of various Parliamentary Committees.

Prof. Rasa Singh Rawat passed away on 10 May 2021 in Ajmer at the age of 79 years.

Shri Sambhajirao Kakade was a member of the 6th and 8th Lok Sabha representing the Baramati Parliamentary Constituency of Maharashtra.

Shri Kakade had earlier been a member of the Maharashtra Legislative Council.

Shri Sambhajirao Kakade passed away on 10 May 2021 in Pune at the age of 85 years.

Shri Ramendra Kumar Yadav was a member of the 9th Lok Sabha representing the Madhepura Parliamentary Constituency of Bihar.

Shri Yadav was also a member of the Bihar Legislative Assembly.

Shri Ramendra Kumar Yadav passed away on 14 May 2021 in Patna at the age of 78 years.

Shri Rajiv Shankarrao Satav was a member of the 16th Lok Sabha representing the Hingoli Parliamentary Constituency of Maharashtra. Shri Satav was also a sitting member of Rajya Sabha.

An able parliamentarian, Shri Satav was a member of the Committee on Defence, Committee on Welfare of the Other Backward Classes and Committee on Railways.

Shri Satav was also a member of the Maharashtra Legislative Assembly.

Shri Rajiv Shankarrao Satav passed away on 16 May 2021 in Pune at the age of 46 years.

Shri K. Thulasiah Vandayar was a member of the 10th Lok Sabha representing the Thanjavur Parliamentary Constituency of Tamil Nadu.

Shri K Thulasiah Vandayar passed away on 17 May 2021 in Chennai at the age of 92 years.

Prof. Chaman Lal Gupta was a member of the 11th, 12th and 13th Lok Sabha representing the Udhampur Parliamentary Constituency of Jammu and Kashmir.

Prof. Chaman Lal Gupta had served as Minister of State (Independent Charge) in the Ministry of Food Processing Industries and Minister of State in the Ministries of Civil Aviation and Defence. He was also a member of various Parliamentary Committees.

Earlier, he served as member of Jammu and Kashmir Legislative Assembly.

Prof. Chaman Lal Gupta passed away on 18 May 2021 in Jammu at the age of 87 years.

Shri Jagannath Pahadia was a member of the 2nd Lok Sabha representing the Sawai Madhopur Parliamentary Constituency of Rajasthan and 4th, 5th and 7th Lok Sabhas representing the Bayana Parliamentary Constituency of Rajasthan.

Shri Jagannath Pahadia was the Governor of Bihar and Haryana. He was also served as Chief Minister of Rajasthan and Union Deputy Minister in the Ministries of Finance, Food & Agriculture, Supply, Communications and Labour and Minister of State for Finance.

Earlier, Shri Pahadia was a member of Rajya Sabha and member of Rajasthan Legislative Assembly.

Shri Jagannath Pahadia passed away on 19 May 2021 in New Delhi at the age of 89 years.

Shri Krishna was a member of the 11th Lok Sabha representing the Parliamentary Constituency of Mandya in Karnataka.

Shri Krishna served as the Speaker of the Karnataka Legislative Assembly and member of Karnataka Legislative Assembly for three terms. He had also served as Minister in the Government of Karnataka.

Shri Krishna passed away on 21 May 2021 in Mysuru at the age of 79 years.

Shri T. M. Kaliyannan was a member of the Provisional Parliament representing the erstwhile State of Madras.

Shri Kaliyannan had also served as a member of the Tamil Nadu Legislative Assembly and Tamil Nadu Legislative Council.

Shri T. M. Kaliannan passed away on 28 May 2021 in Namakkal, Tamil Nadu at the age of 101 years.

Shri Hemendra Singh Banera was a member of the 5th and 9th Lok Sabha from Bhilwara Parliamentary Constituency of Rajasthan.

Shri Banera was a member of the Committee on Estimates.

Shri Hemendra Singh Banera passed away on 31 May 2021 in Bhilwara at the age of 75 years.

Shri Shankar Sakharam Nam was a member of the 12th Lok Sabha representing the Dahanu Parliamentary Constituency of Maharashtra.

Shri Shankar Nam was a member of the Committee on Labour and Welfare.

Shri Shankar Nam served as Member of the Maharashtra Legislative Assembly for three terms. He also served as Deputy Minister in the Government of Maharashtra.

Shri Shankar Sakharam Nam passed away on 5 June 2021 in Thane at the age of 72 years.

Shri Deen Bandhu Verma was a member of the 7th Lok Sabha representing the Udaipur Parliamentary Constituency of Rajasthan.

Shri Verma had earlier been a member of the Rajasthan Legislative Assembly. He had also served as Minister of State in Government of Rajasthan.

Shri Deen Bandhu Verma passed away on 9 June 2021 in Jaipur at the age of 83 years.

Shri Sharad Tripathi was a member of the 16th Lok Sabha representing the Sant Kabir Nagar Parliamentary Constituency of Uttar Pradesh.

Shri Tripathi was a member of the Committee on External Affairs and House Committee.

Shri Sharad Tripathi passed away on 30 June, 2021 in Gurugram at the age of 49 years.

The House also mourns the loss of one of the greatest athletes of India Shri Milkha Singh ji. He brought glory to the country in different competitions in the field of Athletics.

Shri Milkha ji passed away on 18 June, 2021 in Chandigarh.

The House also deeply mourns the demise of one of the finest artists of the country Shri Dileep Kumar ji.

Shri Dileep Kumar entertained us and gave a positive message to the society through his excellent acting skills.

He was also a former Member of Rajya Sabha who passed away on 7 July, 2021 in Mumbai.

The House also mourns the demise of other great personalities of the country.

We deeply mourn the loss of our former colleagues and I am sure the House would join me in conveying our condolences to the bereaved families.

The Members then stood in silence for a short while

***MATTERS UNDER RULE 377**

- (1) **SHRI SUDHAKAR TUKARAM SHRANGARE** laid a statement regarding need to open new sections in Class from First to Tenth in Kendriya Vidyalaya, BSF, Chakur in Latur Parliamentary Constituency, Maharashtra.
- (2) **SUSHRI DIYA KUMARI** laid a statement regarding Developing Tiger Reserve in Kumbhalgarh, Rajasthan.
- (3) **DR. SUJAY VIKHE PATIL** laid a statement regarding notification of Ministry of Defence regarding restricted zones.
- (4) **SHRIMATI SANGEETA KUMARI SINGH DEO** laid a statement regarding grant of CCS Pension to Navodaya Vidyalaya Staff.
- (5) **SHRI MANSUKHBHAI DHANJIBHAI VASAVA** laid a statement regarding need to provide irrigation facilities under Pradhan Mantri Krishi Sinchai Yojana in backward areas in Bharuch Parliamentary Constituency, Gujarat.
- (6) **SHRIMATI RAKSHA KHADSE** laid a statement regarding need to formulate an appropriate export-import policy for the betterment of onion growers.

* Laid on the Table as directed by the Chair.

- (7) **SHRIMATI APARAJITA SARANGI** laid a statement regarding increase in number of doctors and hospital beds in Odisha.
 - (8) **SHRI JANARDAN SINGH SIGRIWAL** laid a statement regarding need to develop waterlogged low land in Bahiyara in Maharajganj Parliamentary Constituency, Bihar as a fishing hub.
 - (9) **SHRI RAMDAS TADAS** laid a statement regarding need to include OBC census in Census 2021.
 - (10) **DR. HEENA VIJAYKUMAR GAVIT** laid a statement regarding updating the Scheduled Areas (Maharashtra) order, 1985.
 - (11) **SHRI HIBI EDEN** laid a statement regarding protest in Union Territory of Lakshdweep over draft policy changes promulgated by the Administrator.
 - (12) **SHRI V. K. SREEKANDAN** laid a statement regarding road accidents in Palakkad district.
 - (13) **SHRI KODIKUNNIL SURESH** laid a statement regarding compassionate employment for eligible family members of Covid-19 deceased employees.
 - (14) **SHRI S. JAGATHRAKSHAKAN** laid a statement regarding concrete action to check inflation.
 - (15) **SHRI BALASHOWRY VALLABHANENI** laid a statement regarding doubling of Farmers' income.
 - (16) **SHRIMATI PRATIMA MONDAL** laid a statement regarding need to construct a platform shed at the Canning Railway station in West Bengal.
 - (17) **DR. ALOK KUMAR SUMAN** laid a statement regarding inclusion of road from Mangalpur (Gopalganj) to Saran Border in Bihar under National Highway.
 - (18) **SHRI CHANDRA SEKHAR SAHU** laid a statement regarding setting up a permanent bench of the High Court in Berhampur, Odisha.
 - (19) **SHRI MALOOK NAGAR** laid a statement regarding need to ensure payment of sugarcane arrears to farmers by sugar mills in Uttar Pradesh.
 - (20) **SHRI KOTHA PRABHAKAR REDDY** laid a statement regarding development of Mega Tourism near Kaleshwaram Lift Irrigation project, Telangana.
 - (21) **SHRI SHRINIWAS DADASAHEB PATIL** laid a statement regarding railway projects causing discontent among farmers.
 - (22) **SHRI M. SELVARAJ** laid a statement regarding introduction of daily express train between Chennai and Karaikudi and passenger trains between Thiruvarur and Karaikudi.
-

STATEMENT BY MINISTER

Re: Reported use of spyware Pegasus to compromise phone data of some persons

THE MINISTER OF RAILWAYS, MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS AND MINISTER OF ELECTRONICS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY (SHRI ASHWINI VAISHNAW): I rise to make a statement on the reported use of spyware Pegasus to compromise phone data of some persons.

A highly sensational story was published by a web portal yesterday night. Many over the top allegations have been made around this story.

The Press reports have appeared a day before the Monsoon Session of Parliament. This cannot be a coincidence.

In the past, similar claims were made regarding the use of Pegasus on WhatsApp. Those reports had no factual basis and were categorically denied by all parties, including in the Supreme Court. The Press reports of 18th July, 2021 also appear to be an attempt to malign the Indian democracy and its well-established institutions.

We cannot fault those who have not read the news story in detail. I request all hon. Members of the House to examine the issues on facts and logic.

The basis of this report is that there is a consortium which has got access to a leaked database of 50,000 phone numbers. The allegation is that individuals linked to these phone numbers were being spied upon. However, the report says that:

“The presence of a phone number in the data does not reveal whether a device was infected with Pegasus or subject to an attempted hack.

Without subjecting a phone to this technical analysis, it is not possible to conclusively state whether it witnessed an attempted hack or was successfully compromised.”

The report itself clarifies that presence of a number in the list does not amount to snooping.

Now let us examine what NSO, the company which owns the technology, has said. I quote:

“NSO Group believes that claims that you have been provided with are based on misleading interpretation of leaked data from basic information, such as HLR Lookup services, which have no bearing on the list of the customers targets of Pegasus or any other NSO products.

Such services are openly available to anyone, anywhere, and anytime, and are commonly used by governmental agencies as well as by private companies worldwide. It is also beyond dispute that the data has nothing to do with surveillance or with NSO. So, there can be no factual basis to suggest that a use of the data somehow equates to surveillance.”

I highlight that the NSO has also said that the list of countries shown using Pegasus is incorrect and many countries mentioned are not even their clients. It also said that most of its clients are western countries.

It is evident that the NSO has also clearly rubbished the claims in the report.

Let us look at India’s established protocol when it comes to surveillance. I am sure, my colleagues in the Opposition who have been in Government for years are very well aware of these protocols.

Since they have governed the country, they would also be aware that any form of illegal surveillance is not possible with the checks and balances in our laws and our robust institutions.

In India, there is a well-established procedure through which lawful interception of electronic communication is carried out for the purpose of national security, particularly on the occurrence of any public emergency or in the interest of public safety, by agencies at the Centre and States. The requests for these lawful interceptions of electronic communication are made as per the relevant rules under the provisions of section 5(2) of Indian Telegraph Act, 1885 and section 69 of the Information Technology Act, 2000.

Each case of interception or monitoring is approved by the competent authority. These powers are also available to the competent authority in the State Governments as per the IT (Procedure and Safeguards for Interception, Monitoring and Decryption of Information) Rules, 2009.

There is a very-well established oversight mechanism in the form of a review committee headed by the Union Cabinet Secretary. In case of a State Government, such cases are reviewed by a committee headed by the Chief Secretary concerned. The law also provides an adjudication process for those people who are adversely affected by any such incident.

The procedure, therefore, ensures that any interception or monitoring of any information is done as per due process of law. The framework and institutions have withstood the test of time.

In conclusion, I humbly submit that:

- The publisher of the report states that it cannot say if the numbers in the published list were under surveillance.
- The company whose technology was allegedly used has denied these claims outrightly.
- And the time-tested procedures of our country are well-established to ensure that unauthorised surveillance cannot occur.

When we look at this issue through the prism of logic, it clearly emerges that there is no substance whatsoever behind this sensationalism.

UTPAL KUMAR SINGH
Secretary General

NOTE: It is the verbatim Debate of the Lok Sabha and not the Synopsis that should be considered authoritative.

English and Hindi versions of Synopses of Lok Sabha Debates are also available at <http://loksabha.nic.in>.